

Memo



Stantec

To:	Mike Birett Waste Diversion Ontario Continuous Improvement Fund Office 92 Caplan Avenue , Suite 511 Barrie, ON L4N 0Z7	From:	Christine Roarke Stantec Consulting Limited 3430 South Service Road, Suite 203 Burlington, ON L7N 3T9
File:	160930103	Date:	January 8, 2010

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2 (Open Space Recycling)

1.0 Study Overview

Stantec was retained in October 2009 to assist Waste Diversion Ontario (CIF), with identifying municipalities in Canada who are conducting, or have completed, open space recycling programs. This work expanded upon the work Stantec recently completed for WDO as documented in the report "Best Practices Review" submitted to WDO, dated October 6, 2009. The enclosed table provides a more complete coverage of open space recycling practices in Canada.

This study was undertaken to confirm if:

- 1) there are open space recycling programs implemented in Canadian municipalities that were not identified in the previous literature search conducted in May 2009 by CDN Research Associated Inc. (CDN); and,
- 2) if quantitative research has been completed on the programs identified which may be used to identify or confirm best practices for open space recycling.

2.0 Methodology

A list of 20 municipalities in Canada was compiled and approved by CIF. The municipalities included those known to be "leaders in recycling" or who were recognized by organizations such as SWANA for their efforts in waste diversion. In addition to the 10 municipalities in Ontario, 10 municipalities across Canada were chosen to represent a variety of sizes, programs and geographic distribution.

Each municipality was contacted by telephone to determine if they have completed any open space recycling programs and how they measure or measured the performance of the open space program(s).

One Team. Infinite Solutions.

Stantec

January 8, 2010

Mike Birett

Page 2 of 9

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

3.0 Summary of Results

In general, the municipalities contacted in Western Canada do not have open space recycling programs because of the provincial deposit/return program. There is little financial incentive for municipalities to provide these types of programs as most material is collected by “binners” (the term used by some municipalities for homeless people). Some municipalities have modified their existing waste collection containers to provide collection points for containers but do not provide stand-alone recycling containers.

In Eastern Canada, there are a wide variety of programs due to the differences in provincial/municipal legislation and population density. These range from wet/dry systems to programs governed by provincial crown corporations.

In Ontario, open space recycling is usually the responsibility of lower-tier municipalities and programs vary from municipality to municipality. Very little has been done to measure the efficiency of open space recycling programs beyond general waste composition studies with the exception of the Region of York and the City of Toronto.

The results of the phone calls to the municipalities across Canada have been summarized in Table 1 attached to this memo.

4.0 Closure

If you have any questions or would like further clarification, please do not hesitate to contact me at your convenience.

Sincerely,

Stantec Consulting Ltd.

– Original Signed By –

Christine Roarke
Planner, Waste Services
Tel: 905-631-3916
Fax: 905-631-8960
christine.roarke@stantec.com

Attachment: Table 1

c. Jim McKay, Stantec Consulting Ltd.

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Table 1 – Summary of Open Space Recycling Programs across Canada

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
City of Kingston, ON John Giles, Manager, Solid Waste 613-546-4291, ext. 2701	Garbage, recycling (2 stream) and organics collection.	Have a dozen units in different areas such as parks, marinas, streets. Contamination is quite low, no worse than carts in multi-residential. Only one unit left out in winter. They tried these units in arenas but had too much contamination.	Tri-sorter made by Fibrex, with 3 x 95 gallon carts inside. Accessed via a flap in the back. Unit is locked and bolted to the ground on a concrete pad. The unit has different shaped openings – paper has a flap, glass and containers have a round opening with rubber flanges, signage around opening. Garbage can placed next to unit.	No.	
Region of Niagara, ON Lydia Torbicki, Manager Policy and Planning, 905-685-4225 ext. 3495	Garbage, recycling (2 stream) and organics collection.				Are working on a pilot project, have submitted a report to council with associated scope of work to implement a pilot public space recycling project.
County of Simcoe, ON Wilma Bureau, Contracts and Collections Supervisor, 705-726-9300 x 1350	County of Simcoe is an upper-tier municipality, only looks after curbside recycling, not open space recycling.			Not likely.	County understands there may be some open space recycling in individual municipalities but doesn't believe there has been any measurement of activities.

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
Region of Halton, ON Shirley McLean, Supervisor, Waste Planning, 905-825-6000 ext.7444	Region of Halton is an upper-tier municipality and does not provide any recycling services to parks. The individual municipalities look after waste collection in the parks and recreation facilities.			Unknown	Would need to contact municipalities to find out what they are doing.
City of Guelph, ON Dean Wyman, Manager of Solid Waste Resources, 519-767-0598 x 2053 Dan Mernahan, Parks Planning 519-837-5616 x 2472 Murray Cameron, Manager of Parkland & Greenways 519-822-1260 x 2007	Wet/dry program.	City had an approved program but budget restraints delayed implementation of program.	Unknown	Unknown	Was unable to speak to someone directly despite numerous attempts to contact staff.
City of London, ON Anne Boyd, Waste Diversion Coordinator 519-661-2500x7304	Garbage and 2-stream recycling	Focus is on collecting containers, not other materials (e.g. fibres). Have containers in parks, arenas, pools and other recreational centres.	Tri-sorters in downtown areas, use regular barrels in parks, painted blue with mobius loop – twinned with garbage containers.	No.	All waste containers were removed from one municipal park as a demonstration project. Users of park encouraged to “pack it in, pack it out”. Park users complied with request to “pack out” their garbage resulting in less litter in parks.
City of Toronto, ON Brenda Librecz, General Manager, Parks, Forestry & Recreation	Garbage, recycling (single-stream) and organics collection.	City provides a variety of receptacles for garbage, and recycling in parks.	Mesh baskets, steel drums and other similar-sized park waste baskets	2006 Parks waste audit	Effect of twinning, labeling and a combination thereof was assessed.

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
Region of York, ON LisaMaria Akeson (905) 668-3437	Garbage, recycling (2 stream) and organics collection.	Region conducted a three-stream waste diversion pilot in 2008 to assess different containers, messaging and identify operational challenges.	Steel drums, mesh containers, solid walled (Earl Bales)3 units, tri-sorters and Molok units with three main variations of lid types which included flat lids, side-loading and flip-up lids.	Waste audits, public surveys	Recommendation made to Council to extend pilot for another year, among other recommendations.
City of Hamilton, ON Adrienne Press, Policy Analyst 905-546-2424x5516	Garbage, recycling (2 stream) and organics collection.	City provides receptacles in some city parks which are staffed.	Blue barrel with round opening with labels on side/top.	Waste composition study conducted in 2007 on waste/recycling containers in 3 parks.	
Quinte West & Belleville, ON	Garbage, recycling (2 stream)			Waste audits conducted to determine effect of placement of recycling and garbage bins. Waste Audits conducted to assess aspects of bin design.	Arenas used for pilot project.
City of Vancouver, B.C. Sue Nagata – 604-257-8541 sue.nagata@vancouver.ca	Provincial Deposit/Return System for containers	Have placed blue bins in parks with concession stands to collect bottles/cans, although typically filled with garbage. City staff do not collect, “binners” remove containers.	Did a pilot project last year where 50 Schaeffer totes were retrofitted for garbage collection with a metal bin to collect containers in the front.	No measurable activities conducted as have no formal program.	Funding is a problem, no money for bins or collection, no market for material. Would rather have material collected by “binners” rather than implement a system.
City of Mission, B.C. Mike Younie, Manager of Environmental Services 604-820-3798	Provincial Deposit/Return System for containers	Use Moloks for garbage, hang a basket in front to collect containers, taken by homeless people.	Basket fastened to front of Molok to capture containers.	No.	

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
		They have carts in some soccer/baseball fields which typically collect cardboard (from beer cases and concession stand). There is no signage in the parks.			
City of Edmonton, AB Chris Saunders, Environmental Manager for Parks, 780-496-7247	Provincial Deposit/Return System for containers	City has approximately 50 containers in parks supplied by the Alberta Beverage Containers Recycling Corporation.	The containers are similar to those found in national parks (pull type – bear proof containers).	No.	The City is not responsible for emptying these containers and usually works with non-profit agencies to coordinate collection. All recyclables are comingled (similar to residential program) - no separate streams or containers. No measurable activities. Minimal signage (recycling logo only) as City has a policy prohibiting advertising in parks.
City of Saskatoon, SK Colleen Yates, Environmental Programs Manager 306-975-2487	Provincial Deposit/Return System for containers	Do not do any recycling in parks. A company called “Creative Outdoor Advertising” installs, collects and processes materials. City receives a percentage of revenue.	Have silver tri-sorters on streets.	No.	No information on performance, just tonnage.
City of Winnipeg, MB Randy Park, Waste Diversion Supervisor 204-986-6806	Garbage and single-stream recycling.	Don't have formal program in parks. Have open space recycling on street	Use OMG containers – silver Tri-sorter.	Waste audits have been conducted at the MRF but not specifically on open	Garbage is collected by public works staff. City receives approximately 4 tonnes

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
		corners, public right-of-ways, and downtown areas. City provides advice on placement of containers. OMG is responsible for provision, installation, and maintenance of containers. OMG collects recyclables and delivers to City MRF – City retains 100% of revenue from materials. Parks department look after recycling in parks informally, process material through civic office recycling program.		space recycling containers.	per month of recyclables and hasn't heard that contamination is a big issue for processor (Emterra Environmental). Received 52.64 tonnes of material (mostly containers by volume, newspaper by weight). Collection can be problematic especially in downtown area during business hours – usually collect in the evening.
City of Sherbrooke, PQ Christine Fliesen 819-821-5474	Garbage, recycling, organics	Have green and blue bins in some, but not all parks. Have some signage, no differentiated openings.	Bins and carts	No.	
City of Moncton, NB Dan Hicks, Supervisor of Parks and Grounds 506-853-3585	Wet/dry system	No separate containers for recycling as it is a wet/dry system.	Have a variety of types of containers depending on the setting (45 gallon drums, steel containers, concrete containers). (Internet research shows OMG containers used – 2 compartments for dry material, 1 for wet)	There may be some auditing done at the landfill to determine compliance with wet/dry requirements.	
City of Halifax, NS Sheena Clark 902-490-	5 – stream program	Recycling is mandated under Bylaw 600, section	Bins used depend on the type of space but	No.	In the business sector, malls have bins but are

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
5479 clarks@halifax.ca		12.4 – 4 stream recycling in public places (paper, glass/cans, organics, garbage) – shopping malls, food courts, arenas and parks. Signage follows municipal guidelines for signage, have colour coding on signs so people can identify the bin as they approach, bins are stickered and have a description of the types of acceptable materials. Parks are considered ICI and have no set standard – it is up to parks to decide what types of containers to use. Signage is consistent with that used by the City.	are generally cluster bins. No differentiated openings on bins.		not particularly functional. They are in the process of conducting waste audits for multi-residential buildings but have no data for parks.
City of Charlottetown, PE Paul Johnston, Manager of Public Works, 902-566-5548	Source separation is mandated by Provincial Waste Watch System. Waste Management system governed by Island Waste Management Corporation. Garbage, recycling (2 stream) and organics collection.	City collects waste, delivers to depot for processing. Found in municipal areas, streetscapes. Government has dictated guidelines for containers, and what must be collected.	Have 3-stream source separation – organics, recyclables and waste. Receptacles are single waste containers (tri-sorters) with 3 openings – openings are differentiated by size/shape. Bins are labeled.		Residential properties are taxed which funds provincial collection services. Businesses and corporate identities follow same guidelines but must provide for their own disposal.
City of St. Johns, NF Janine Piller 709-754-2489	Garbage collection.	Do not do any open space recycling, have done visual audit of		No.	They are rolling out a curbside recycling program in 2010 and

Reference: Best Practices Review Part 2

Municipality	Type of Waste Management System	Open Space Recycling Program Details	Details of Containers	Measurable Activities	Other
		garbage in parks and found there are no containers as Province has deposit/return system.			don't want to spend extra money on open space recycling if not getting much material.